

CARLSMITH BALL LLP  
DAVID LEDGER (CNMI BAR NO. F0195)  
Carlsmith Ball LLP Building  
Capitol Hill  
Post Office Box 5241  
Saipan, MP 96950-5241  
Tel No. 670.322.3455  
Attorneys for Defendant  
Aviation Services (CNMI), Ltd. dba Freedom Air

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE  
NORTHERN MARIANA ISLANDS

MOSES T. FEJERAN and  
QIANYAN S. FEJERAN,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

AVIATION SERVICES (CNMI),  
LTD. dba FREEDOM AIR,

Defendant.

CIVIL ACTION NO. 05-0033

**DEFENDANT AVIATION SERVICES  
(CNMI) LTD. DBA FREEDOM AIR'S  
OPPOSITION TO MOTION TO COMPEL;  
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

**HEARING DATE: MARCH 15, 2007  
TIME: 1:30 P.M.**

**DEFENDANT AVIATION SERVICES (CNMI) LTD. DBA FREEDOM AIR'S  
OPPOSITION TO MOTION TO COMPEL**

The substance of this Opposition to the Motion to Compel is briefed in Defendant Aviation Services (CNMI), Ltd. dba Freedom Air's Motion to Strike Frank Perez as an Expert Witness and to Order IME, filed February 6, 2007, and its Reply Memorandum in Support of its Motion to Strike, filed concurrently herewith. Defendant herein incorporates the arguments presented in its Motion to Strike and Reply Memorandum. Further, without unnecessarily restating the issues already before the Court under the Motion to Strike, Defendant makes the

1 following points specifically in response to the Motion to Compel:

2 1. Plaintiffs' expert Frank Perez inspected Defendant's aircraft in August  
3 2006.

4 2. Through motions and various emails, Plaintiffs represented to the Court  
5 and to Defendant's counsel that it would disclose an expert report by late September 2007. They  
6 failed to do so and to this day have failed to do so.

7 3. Plaintiffs now have had seven months to produce Mr. Perez's report,  
8 leaving only one month for Defendant's expert report to inspect the plane and compile his own  
9 expert report and rebuttal expert report. As a result, Defendant has been prejudiced by not being  
10 allowed adequate time to prepare its own expert report.

11 4. The information Plaintiffs requested and sought to be compelled pertains  
12 to the heights of the risers, the widths of treads, and the railings, all of which directly relate to  
13 Mr. Perez's testimony. However, Mr. Perez's report is now untimely.

14 5. Because of the untimely report, the Court has grounds to strike Mr. Perez  
15 as an expert witness, as there is no purpose to disclose the information requested.

16 6. Plaintiffs cite but fail to make a few important points outlined in *Jayne H.*  
17 *Lee, Inc. v. Flagstaff Indus. Corp.*, 173 F.R.D. 651 (D. Md. 1997). Specifically, *Jayne H. Lee*  
18 discusses at length the timely and cooperative measures that counsel must strive to maintain  
19 when it comes to discovery disputes. Plaintiffs have failed to meet the *Jayne H. Lee* standard of  
20 timeliness and cooperation by failing to provide Mr. Perez's report by the agreed-upon late-  
21 September deadline.

22 7. It is furthermore ironic that Plaintiffs - who have failed to produce an  
23 expert report within the past seven months and now seek an additional two months to compile -  
24 now seek to impose sanctions on Defendant. There is no justification for imposing any sanctions  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 on Defendant in light of the extreme untimeliness of Mr. Perez's report and the present Motion to  
2 Strike Mr. Perez's testimony.

3 In sum, Plaintiffs' Motion to Compel should be denied because it seeks the disclosure of  
4 information for a report that should have been submitted six months ago, and which now cannot  
5 be disclosed without imposing great prejudice on Defendant. Moreover, the request for  
6 sanctions should be denied on the grounds that Plaintiff is at fault for the late disclosure of Mr.  
7 Perez's report, and the subsequent irrelevance of his expert opinions.  
8

9 DATED: Hagåtña, Guam, March 5, 2007.

10 CARLSMITH BALL LLP

11 /s/ David P. Ledger  
12

13 DAVID LEDGER  
14 Attorneys for Defendant  
15 Aviation Services (CNMI), Ltd.  
16 dba Freedom Air  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby declares that on the 5th day of March 2007, I will cause to be served, via electronic filing/service, a true and correct copy of **DEFENDANT AVIATION SERVICES (CNMI) LTD. DBA FREEDOM AIR'S OPPOSITION TO MOTION TO COMPEL; CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE** upon the following Counsel of record.

George L. Hasselback, Esq.  
O'Connor Berman Dotts & Banes  
Second Floor, Nauru Building  
Post Office Box 501969  
Saipan, MP 96950

DATED: March 5, 2007.

/s/ David P. Ledger

---

DAVID LEDGER